DISTRICT OF SAANICH MINUTES OF THE SPECIAL COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE MEETING FINANCIAL PLAN HELD IN THE GARTH HOMER CENTRE AUDITORIUM **813 DARWIN AVENUE** TUESDAY, FEBRUARY 21, 2012 AT 7:30 P.M.

Present:

Public

Chair: Mayor Leonard

Council: Councillors Brice, Brownoff, Derman, Gerrard, Murdock, Sanders, Wade and Wergeland

T. Wood, Administrator; P. Murray, Director of Finance; D. Henderson, Staff: Director of Parks & Recreation; D. Dupas, Legislative Manager; and A. Park, Senior Committee Clerk,

3040-65 CEDAR HILL GOLF COURSE SUSTAINABILITY (Golf Course)

The supplemental joint report of the Municipal Administrator, the Director of Parks & Recreation and the Director of Finance, dated February 21, 2012, was before the Committee, along with their joint report dated February 21. 2012.

The Administrator stated that following the Financial Plan meeting of February 7, 2012, a meeting with the golf course stakeholders took place. The Directors' original recommendation with respect to the Golf Course has been revised and a supplemental report prepared. Changes to the recommended Option 3 include unlimited rounds for Junior passholders, and a reservation practice based on the 2011 approach with the addition of restricted passholder drop-in access on Fridays and Statutory Holidays. Also, from March to October 2012 the Golf Professional, TruStar Golf Inc. and Saanich staff will be tasked with frequent monitoring and further adjusting of the advance booking system and scheduling of block times, if possible, to balance the desire for pass holder preferred tee times with the requirement to eliminate the annual deficit. The supplemental report recommends approval of the fees outlined and requests staff to monitor the operations and provide an interim report to Council in September 2012.

PUBLIC PRESENTATIONS Presentations

Mr. R. Winkenhower, 3190 Mars Street, stated:

- He appreciates many aspects of the Cedar Hill Golf Course, including its trails, natural areas and restaurant; it is not just a golf course and restaurant but a well-used park.

Mrs. P. Houston, 1263 Tracksell Avenue, stated:

- She lives near the golf course and wants to emphasize the community aspect of the park; because it benefits the entire community, taxes should support its operation.
- The public should be consulted when things are not going well and given an opportunity to assist.

Mr. R. Bain, 4471 Arsens Place, who spoke at the previous Financial Plan meeting, requested leave to address the Committee a second time. Leave was granted for Mr. Bain to speak after all other participants had been heard.

Mr. I. Crawford, 802 Darwin Avenue, stated:

- He believes the best value for money is offered by the municipal level of government.
- It has been reported that there is an oversupply of golf courses on the Island; other uses could be considered for a portion of the golf course, such as allotment gardening or farming, with potential leasing income.
- Saanich policies support and encourage community gardens.

Mrs. L. England, 4989 Georgia Park Terrace, stated:

- She was shocked to hear that the golf course operation had an ongoing deficit and wonders why the business model was not enhanced before it reached this stage.
- Council might consider granting a six month extension to the restaurant and then reevaluating its performance.

Mr. C. Lawrence, 83 Crease Avenue, stated;

- He is a long time member of the Cedar Hill Golf Course and would remind Council that the Club made money in past years.
- He fears this situation may result in the eventual closure of the golf course.
- Bad management is the problem, not the passholders; a capable golf course management team is needed.

Mr. J. Miller, 1288 Astoria Street, stated:

- The decision to close the restaurant was taken before anyone knew about the issues; another restaurateur would love to take over the facility.
- Municipal administration should not be involved in running a golf courseleave it to professionals.
- Involve stakeholders when making these types of decisions.

Mr. J. Monty, no address given, stated:

- The timing of this decision interests him as the issues could have been considered prior to the election.
- Financial information should be available to taxpayers; they can provide valuable ideas.

Mrs. G. (Potter) Hunter, 410-3160 Albina Street, stated:

- It is important for Council to consider all the ideas put forth for improving the golf course operation.
- A three to five year plan is needed.
- Do not restrict passholders as they are the ones who financially support the course; limiting the number of rounds is too restrictive when the real golf season runs from April to October.
- We should be encouraging play not limiting tee times.
- Members support an increase in the cost of the passes.
- Discount options, such as are in place for recreation centre passes, could be considered.

Mrs. I. Farquhar, 3834 Ascot Drive, appeared on behalf of A. Graber, Past Captain of Cedar Hill Golf Club:

- A letter of support from Mayor Leonard to the golf course in 2002 was

read.

- At one of the stakeholder meetings they learned the Cedar Hill Golf Course Advisory Committee would not be reappointed.
- The public participation process was simply a gesture; only one small concession has been made after all the input.

Mrs. M. Hurtig-Mitchell, 2587 Empire Street, stated:

- The apparent lack of transparency in the decision-making process on the operation of the golf course, has resulted in a lack of faith.
- Mediocre options have been offered.
- Mismanagement has caused the problems.

Mrs. A. Sweeten, 550 Dumeresq Street, stated:

- As a working person, she was forced to buy a full pass in order to play golf on weekends at Cedar Hill; younger players are not joining due to the restrictions; existing members are being pushed away.
- Saanich supports other sports leagues in parks and could also support league play at the Cedar Hill Golf Course.
- Immediate improvements could include: a requirement to pay if you don't show up; well trained course marshalls with enforcement authority; better signage on the course and trails for safety reasons.
- Mr. A. Andersen, Glasgow Avenue, stated:
- He is a passholder and was not aware of the financial problems.
- Users do not expect to be subsidized.
- Staff recommendations will not achieve their objective; the best approach would be a campaign to increase the number of passholders.
- Limiting the number of rounds is unnecessary; revenue from green fee players is stable and unlikely to increase.

Mr. J. Bate, 1283 Tattersall Drive, stated:

- He chairs an annual golf tournament at Cedar Hill Golf Course which is in its 19th year; a restaurant is an integral part of any tournament.
- He doesn't accept the idea that the golf course has to be self-sustaining when other recreation centres are not; if restaurant losses are not included, the golf course deficit is lower than other Saanich recreation facilities.

Mr. A. Smith, 1694 Cedar Hill Cross Road, stated:

- The 60th Anniversary of the Cedar Hill Golf Club is coming up.
- In earlier years, there was a great deal of support on Council for the golf club but that has diminished.
- A reserve fund for profits of the club was suggested but never implemented; badly needed clubhouse improvements were delayed for many years.
- Operating profits from 1984 to 2004 were over 4 million dollars and, after capital improvements, a profit remained which should have been used for needed drainage and repairs.
- Overhead charges should be charged in the same way as for other municipal buildings.

Mrs. C. Miller, 1288 Astoria Street, stated:

- The municipality should use the expertise of interested citizens to improve the golf course and restaurant operations.
- Allotment gardens are not a suitable use for a Garry Oak ecosystem which may be of important long term benefit to Vancouver Island.

Mr. R. Gillespie, former Saanich Councillor, stated:

- The restaurant closing was sad, especially when the community had been asking for a management change for the past five years.
- The public engagement process proposed by four members of Council would allow all of the stakeholders to participate; give them until September.
- Two different policies exist in Saanich one for the recreation centres and one for the golf course.
- For thirty years the course made a profit and there is a reason for the recent losses – bad management.
- Information, time and process was not given to the community; it will take time to develop the right long term plan for the golf course.

Mrs. S. Coates, 4129 Tuxedo Drive, stated:

- Council and staff appear not to care.
- She is willing to have her taxes support the golf course but would not support office uses in the closed restaurant space.

Mr. M. Brown, 956 Cloverdale Avenue, stated:

- The golf course has been assessed differently than other facilities; his local park and recreation centre don't pay for themselves.
- The lack of signs for the restaurant was a failing.
- Council has shown itself open to allowing exceptions from the requirements when development approvals are considered.

Mrs. L. King, 1615 Ryan Street, stated:

- She is in the business of loyalty programs and understands that when sales are down, you go back to your customers and find out why.
- Treating them with respect, making them welcome and building on what you have, is always an effective strategy.

Mrs. S. Cook, 1670 Sheridan Avenue, stated:

- Her family are golfers and found the restaurant closing sad.
- She wonders where the 60th Anniversary of the Golf Club will be celebrated.

Mrs. P. Peddlesden, 2179 West Coast Road, Sooke, stated:

- She is a member of Golf Club; it appears that Council and staff prefer green fee players to passholders but the void left by passholders will not be filled by green fee players.
- Tournaments need a banquet room; closing the restaurant will further impact golf revenues.
- It would be inappropriate to consider offices in space contributed to by the Golf Club.
- The ideas put forward by residents should not be ignored.

Mrs. J. Kalina, 1253 Oakmount Road, stated:

- She has mixed feelings about golf but cares about the golf course environment; it is a multi-purpose recreational asset.
- She enjoys the wildlife in the park and could see some of the lands being returned to a natural state.
- Other environmental issues are ignored while the golf course is maintained.

Mr. B. Rogers, 805-510 Marsett Place, stated:

- Council should use a facilitator and public expertise to resolve the problems at the golf course.
- Many more passes would be purchased if the operation were improved.
- All golf courses are based on memberships.
- Limiting rounds when no one is playing, is not sensible.

Mr. A. Ruszel, 3740 Ascot Drive, stated:

- His family uses the trail and restaurant; he believes the restaurant was never utilized to its full potential; drab décor, poor lighting, lack of advertising and signs discouraged patrons.
- He would suggest giving the restaurant one year to turn around.

Mrs. P. Smith, 1694 Cedar Hill Cross Road, stated:

- She is a member of the golf club.
- The pass program works and other organizations manage to use them successfully; Saanich should promote the sale of golf passes; discounts could be offered and unlimited use considered.

Mr. K. Moore, 1268 Camrose Crescent, stated:

- He uses the trails and course.
- Council should be acting on the community's behalf.
- Golf courses need a restaurant.

Leave was granted for the following persons to speak to the Committee a second time on this subject:

Mr. R. Bain, 4471 Arsens Place, stated:

- He is still waiting for additional financial information on the food and beverage operations.
- If a private restaurateur were to take over the restaurant, the same accounting method should apply.

Mrs. M. Bachmann, 3720 Ascot Drive, stated:

- The public have said they can help fix the golf course problems and Council should allow them to do so.
- The Cedar Hill Golf Course and restaurant, is a community meeting place; the decision to close the restaurant was made hastily.
- Apparently the Parks & Recreation Master Plan mentioned the option of selling off the golf course, which is a concern.
- She expects honesty and transparency but has found it difficult to determine what is really going on with the golf course operation.

Mr. D. MacKenzie, 4163 Clinton Place, stated:

- He was barred unfairly from the stakeholders meetings on the Golf Course.
- He has complained repeatedly about the management of the course without satisfaction.
- Limiting passholder rounds will not improve revenues.
- He would recommend a task force to investigate the problems .

Mr. J. Bates, 995 Ridgeway Street, stated:

- Accountability for the Golf Course is not evident.
- Normally one reduces costs by reducing wages and increasing productivity.
- He would remind Council that they work for all of the people who have expressed their views at these meetings.

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE DELIBERATIONS

MOVED by Councillor Wade and Seconded by Councillor Brice: "That it be recommended that:

1. The following fees, as contained in the joint report of the Municipal Administrator, the Director of Parks & Recreation and the Director of Finance dated February 21, 2012 be approved effective April 1, 2012:

Green Fees	2012/2013 (\$5 increase)	2013/2014 (\$2 increase)	2014/2015 (\$2 increase)
Mon. – Thurs.	40.60	42.70	44.80
Fri. – Sun. & Holidays	45.60	47.70	49.80
Twilight (Mon – Sun) & Winter Green Fee	35.60	37.70	39.80
9 Hole (AM)	25.60	27.70	29.80
Junior (18 & under)	25.00	25.00	25.00

Pass Rates	2012/2013	2013/2014	2014/2015
Full (5% per year)	1417.50	1488.50	1563.00
Restricted (3.5% per year) Mon – Thurs	1086.75	1125.00	1164.25
Junior (18 & under)	250.00	250.00	250.00

* All rates include taxes

Pass Restrictions & Blocks:

- o Maximum four rounds per week for full pass holders
- o Maximum three rounds per week for restricted pass holders
- o Total summer rounds for full pass holders (2012 55, 2013 50, 2014 45)
- o Total winter rounds for full pass holders (2012 35, 2013 40, 2014 45)

- o Total summer rounds for restricted pass holders (2012 60, 2013 55, 2014 55)
- o Total winter rounds for restricted pass holders (2012 50, 2013 45, 2014 35)
- o Fifteen full pass holder tee time blocks Saturdays, Sundays and Statutory Holidays
- o Tuesday block for Ladies' Club (8:30 10:00am approximate)
- o Wednesday block for Seniors (first two hours of day)
- o Green fee block first two hours of twilight, Monday Sunday;

Weekday Punch Cards	2012/2013	2013/2014	2014/2015
Summer (10% discount)	365.40	383.40	401.40
Winter (20% discount)	284.80	300.80	316.80

* All rates include taxes

- 2. The Director of Parks & Recreation be instructed to engage golf course users and the public to discuss how the restructured food and beverage, and golf course and club house operations can best meet customer and community needs in the context of the Cedar Hill Golf Course deficit reduction strategy; and
- 3. Staff report back to Council annually at budget discussions to ensure that the facility is on course to meet targets."

Councillor Wade stated:

- The original staff recommendation did not direct staff to engage the public; this motion is more open-ended, allows for the use of public engagement tools, and will have the effect of informing Council's decision, ensuring the financial viability of the golf course and that the expertise of all users and the public is brought forward and built upon.
- The long term viability of the golf course facility is critical.

Councillor Derman stated:

- He cannot support the motion or the original recommendation; a task force to look at the entire food and golf course operation would be preferable.
- Council insists that developers conduct community consultation before considering their applications and Council should do the same.
- Saanich has accepted the role of providing affordable golf and low cost recreation services; golf should not be considered differently.
- Golf provides a social experience and appropriate food service is needed.
- He would prefer to approve an increase in fees only for the first year, then start a stakeholder process to best determine how to return the operation to viability.

Councillor Gerrard stated:

- The majority of Saanich taxpayers wish to keep taxes down and in that context, Council adopted recommendations from the TruStar report and unanimously decided to close the restaurant.
- He supports the motion.

Councillor Murdock stated:

- He would have benefitted from this public input before any decision was taken with respect to the golf course.
- He wants a stronger recommendation to ensure a facilitated open process that includes all stakeholders.
- He does not support increasing fees while providing less; considering fees in isolation is not effective since they are only a small part of the larger picture; a business case is necessary.
- With the help of the public, Council can ensure the golf course will be sustainable and remain a community asset in perpetuity.

Councillor Sanders stated:

- She is unhappy with the way this issue has been handled and does not support the motion.
- It is time to look at the whole package of the park, its natural areas, the recreation centre and the golf course; a long term plan is needed to address all aspects.

Councillor Brownoff stated:

- The community is engaged on this issue; it is appropriate to commence a facilitated review process, independent of staff, regarding this important public asset.
- Golf course passes should not be treated differently from other recreation centre passes which have no restrictions attached.
- The Golf Club members are not opposed to a fee increase but strongly oppose a reduction in rounds.
- Restructuring of the golf course food and beverage services was needed; residents have offered their expertise.
- A business plan is required, not just tinkering with fees and passes.

Councillor Wergeland stated:

- The budget figures show real challenges facing the municipality; more reductions will be sought.
- He would like residents to get involved in the larger budget process for the entire municipal operation.
- The restaurant decision was fair and reasonable.
- There is shared responsibility for the golf course financial situation.
- Green fee players must be considered as well as passholders.

Councillor Brice stated:

- Everyone has indicated their support for a viable golf course and park; there are different opinions on how to achieve this.
- She supports the motion; it is balanced and will accomplish much of what has been requested at these public meetings; all want the same result.

Mayor Leonard stated;

 The motion is supportable and will lead to a bright future for the golf course.

The Motion was then Put and CARRIED Councillors Brownoff, Derman, Murdock and Sanders Opposed.

Adjournment On a motion from Councillor Gerrard the meeting adjourned at 10:27 pm.

CHAIR

I hereby certify these Minutes are accurate.

MUNICIPAL CLERK

DISTRICT OF SAANICH MINUTES OF THE SPECIAL COUNCIL MEETING HELD IN THE GARTH HOMER CENTRE AUDITORIUM 813 DARWIN AVENUE TUESDAY, FEBRUARY 21, 2012 AT 10:28 P.M.

Present:

Chair: Mayor Leonard Council: Councillors Brice, Brownoff, Derman, Gerrard, Murdock, Sanders, Wade and Wergeland

Staff: Tim Wood, Administrator; Paul Murray, Director of Finance; Doug Henderson, Director of Parks & Recreation; Donna Dupas, Legislative Manager; and Andrea Park, Senior Committee Clerk

RECOMMENDATIONS FROM COMMITTEE

From the Special Committee of the Whole Financial Plan Meeting held February 21, 2012

<u>3040-65</u> (Golf Course)

CEDAR HILL GOLF COURSE SUSTAINABILITY

MOVED by Councillor Wade and Seconded by Councillor Brice: "That:

1. The following fees, as contained in the joint supplemental report of the Municipal Administrator, the Director of Parks & Recreation and the Director of Finance dated February 21, 2012 be approved effective April 1, 2012:

Green Fees	2012/2013	2013/2014	2014/2015
	(\$5 increase)	(\$2 increase)	(\$2 increase)
Mon. – Thurs.	40.60	42.70	44.80

Fri. – Sun. & Holidays	45.60	47.70	49.80
Twilight (Mon – Sun)	35.60	37.70	39.80
& Winter Green Fee			
9 Hole (AM)	25.60	27.70	29.80
Junior (18 & under)	25.00	25.00	25.00
Pass Rates	2012/2013	2013/2014	2014/2015
Full (5% per year)	1417.50	1488.50	1563.00
Restricted (3.5% per	1086.75	1125.00	1164.25
year)			
Mon – Thurs			
Junior (18 & under)	250.00	250.00	250.00

* All rates include taxes

Pass Restrictions & Blocks:

- o Maximum four rounds per week for full pass holders
- o Maximum three rounds per week for restricted pass holders
- o Total summer rounds for full pass holders (2012 55, 2013 50, 2014 45)
- o Total winter rounds for full pass holders (2012 35, 2013 40, 2014 45)
- o Total summer rounds for restricted pass holders (2012 60, 2013 55, 2014 55)
- o Total winter rounds for restricted pass holders (2012 50, 2013 45, 2014 35)
- o Fifteen full pass holder tee time blocks Saturdays, Sundays and Statutory Holidays
- o Tuesday block for Ladies' Club (8:30 10:00am approximate)
- o Wednesday block for Seniors (first two hours of day)
- o Green fee block first two hours of twilight, Monday Sunday;

Weekday Punch Cards	2012/2013	2013/2014	2014/2015
Summer (10% discount)	365.40	383.40	401.40
Winter (20% discount)	284.80	300.80	316.80

* All rates include taxes

- 2. The Director of Parks & Recreation be instructed to engage golf course users and the public to discuss how the restructured food and beverage, and golf course and club house operations can best meet customer and community needs in the context of the Cedar Hill Golf Course deficit reduction strategy; and
- 3. Staff report back to Council annually at budget discussions to ensure that the facility is on course to meet targets."

In response to questions from the Council, the Administrator stated:

- Council did not appoint any members of the Cedar Hill Golf Course

Advisory Committee for 2012 pending the outcome of discussions with stakeholders on the financial status of the golf course facility; former members of the Advisory Committee were selected as stakeholders.

- It is Council's decision whether or not to appoint members to a Cedar Hill Golf Course Advisory Committee.
- The supplemental report dated February 21, 2012 recommends fees applicable to 2015, as did the original report.
- If significant issues need to be addressed in that time period, staff would not hesitate to bring them back for Council consideration.

In response to further questions regarding her motion, Councillor Wade stated:

- The motion is open-ended on purpose and Council and staff will be looking for suggestions on how best to proceed.
- A mid-course correction would be considered if necessary.

The Motion was then Put and CARRIED Councillors Brownoff, Derman, Murdock and Sanders Opposed.

<u>3040-65</u> (Golf Course)

CEDAR HILL GOLF COURSE PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT

The following Motion was referred to this meeting from the Council Meeting of February 6, 2012.

MOVED by Councillor Brownoff and Seconded by Councillor Murdock: "That Saanich host a facilitated public engagement process that includes all stakeholders to look at the Cedar Hill Golf Course facility and develop a long-term strategy for its operation."

Councillor Brownoff stated:

- An independently facilitated engagement process is necessary.

Councillor Sanders stated:

- An independent process for full public engagement is needed; use the enthusiasm and expertise displayed at the public meetings.
- A long term strategy for the golf course should be developed.

Councillor Murdock stated:

 All of Council are looking for the same outcome; staff could be directed to prepare design details for an engagement process.

Councillor Derman stated:

- He supports the motion; both processes could work together.

Councillor Brice stated:

- Everyone wants a happy golf experience at a reasonable rate.
- The motion already passed has the scope to deal with all concerns raised.

Mayor Leonard stated:

- It would be redundant to pass this motion.
- It is the responsibility of Saanich management to work this through.

The Motion was then Put and DEFEATED Mayor Leonard, Councillors Brice, Gerrard, Wade and Wergeland Opposed

Adjournment On a motion from Councillor Gerrard the meeting adjourned at 10:40 pm.

.....

MAYOR

I hereby certify these Minutes are accurate.

......

MUNICIPAL CLERK